

OHIO MINE SUBSIDENCE INSURANCE UNDERWRITING ASSOCIATION ANNUAL REPORT

January 2016 Through December 2016

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abandoned Underground Mines How they impact Ohioans	Pgs. 1-2
Background	Pgs. 2-3
Outreach Program	Pgs. 4-5
Mine Subsidence Claim Handling	Pgs. 5-6
Financial and Statistical Info.	Pg. 7
Exhibits	Pgs. 8-10

This report is submitted by the board members of the Ohio Mine Subsidence Insurance Underwriting Association, James Zehringer, Director of Natural Resources, Chairman; Josh Mandel, Treasurer of State; and Sabrina Wang, insurance industry representative from an Ohio domiciled carrier, Nationwide Insurance.

ABANDONED UNDERGROUND MINES

How they impact Ohioans

In the United States, approximately 100,000 underground mines are known to exist, of which 90% are inactive or abandoned. Approximately one-fourth of the total surface area overlying these mines has been affected by subsidence. An estimated 99% of the subsided land overlies underground voids created by coal mining, while the remaining 1% is attributed to the underground extraction of metallic and nonmetallic minerals.

For more than a century and a half, underground mining, mainly for coal, has been an active industry in Ohio. During this period, over 6,900 underground coal and other mineral mines have been abandoned (see Exhibit 1). These mines range in size from small "doghole" mines utilized by individuals for home heating to huge operations extending for several square miles.

Several generations of mining have left us with both a tradition of mining and a legacy of abandoned mines. Now, with an expanding population and its demand on space, the problems involved with abandoned underground mines are being fully realized. One such problem is that of mine subsidence loss and/or damage caused by the collapse or the lateral or vertical movement of structures resulting from the caving in of underground mines.

Geologic and mining factors that directly affect the extent of subsidence include the following: the mining method; the vertical and lateral dimension of the mine cavity; the depth of the mine void below ground surface; overburden characteristics; size, distribution and nature of support pillars; surface topography; location of ground water; and the method and quantity of backfilling used, if any. Prediction of when and where mine subsidence occurs is in its infancy state of development and research.

Two types of subsidence occur in Ohio. The first type, referred to as room and pillar subsidence occurs when the mine roof (substrata rock) collapses into a void created by the removal of coal. Shaft collapse, the second type of subsidence, takes place when an air or coal haulage shaft, which has been

inadequately sealed, collapses. Shaft collapse can occur suddenly and is considered the most hazardous type of subsidence.

MINE SUBSIDENCE INSURANCE

Background

The Mine Subsidence Insurance Program in Ohio has undergone various changes since its inception. This section of the annual report will indicate the evolution of the program since its inception in 1987.

The Ohio Legislature enacted Ohio Revised Code sections 3929.50 to 3929.53 and 3929.55 to 3929.61 in January of 1985. This Act authorized the establishment of the Mine Subsidence Insurance Governing Board, the Mine Subsidence Insurance Fund (MSIF), and the Ohio Mine Subsidence Insurance Underwriting Association (OMSIUA).

The Governing Board originally consisted of the Director of Natural Resources or designee as chairperson, the Treasurer of State or designee, and one representative from an Ohio domiciled insurance company. The MSIF is administered by the Governing Board and the Treasurer of State is the custodian of the Fund. The MSIF was initially funded with state and federal government appropriations. The premium for mine subsidence insurance coverage was initially established at a level intended to cover all foreseeable claims, normal operating expenses, a reserve for unexpected contingencies, and to provide for repayment of all government funds.

The Governing Board has entered into a contract with the Ohio FAIR Plan Underwriting Association (OFPUA) for administrative duties since the inception of the program. The contract provides for OFPUA to perform administrative and claim services for the OMSIUA. OFPUA personnel are trained to handle necessary administrative duties and mine subsidence insurance claims.

Insurance companies who write basic property or multi-peril policies on a direct basis for 1-4 family dwellings in the 37 eligible counties are required to become members of the OMSIUA and offer the mine subsidence coverage to all eligible applicants. Companies can be exempted from active participation if approved by the Department of Insurance.

In April of 1992, the Ohio Legislature recognized that the program was not sufficiently populated to provide necessary funds for claims and operating expenses, for appropriate reserves, and for repayment of State and Federal monies. The Ohio Revised Code was amended to provide:

1. The addition of the Superintendent of Insurance or designee to the Mine Subsidence Insurance Governing Board.

2. The designation of 26 Ohio counties as counties in which mine subsidence coverage is automatically added to dwelling fire, homeowners, or commercial fire policies for which dwelling/non-commercial/personal lines rates are applicable. The premium for the coverage, since 7/1/99, is \$1.00 for these 26 "mandatory" counties.

3. The designation of additional Ohio counties as "optional" counties. Owners of eligible properties in these counties must be offered the mine subsidence coverage and decide whether or not to buy the coverage. The premium for these insureds, since 7/1/99, is \$5.00.

This legislative change has provided sufficient revenue for claims and operating expense payments, appropriate reserves, and repayment of government funds.

In December 2004, the Ohio General Assembly passed House Bill 425, legislation initiated by the Ohio Department of Insurance and the Ohio Department of Natural Resources. This legislation was signed by the Governor in early 2005 and provided for changes to the Mine Subsidence Insurance Program in Ohio.

This legislation allowed the Mine Subsidence Insurance Governing Board to

review and make changes to the coverage amounts, limits, and structure types. In addition, the legislation provided the Governing Board the flexibility to increase coverage up to a maximum limit of \$300,000. Proposed changes were addressed in 2005 via amendments to Ohio Administrative Rule 3901-1-48 and ultimately to the mine subsidence insurance coverage form effective January 1, 2006.

The mine subsidence insurance coverage form changes for 2006 included:

1. Increasing the maximum limit on the dwelling structure to \$100,000 from \$50,000. This increased limit was applicable unless the dwelling coverage amount provided on the insurance policy to which the mine subsidence insurance coverage form attached was less than \$100,000.

2. Loss adjustment was expanded to a replacement cost basis from an actual cash value basis provided repairs caused by Mine Subsidence were made.

3. An additional coverage amount of up to 10% of the mine subsidence coverage limit of liability for the insured dwelling was provided for detached private garages.

4. An additional coverage amount of up to 10% of the mine subsidence coverage limit of liability for the insured structure was provided for driveways and sidewalks damaged by the same subsidence occurrence that damaged the dwelling structure.

5. An additional coverage amount of up to \$5,000 for additional living expense and/or fair rental value if the insured structure was not fit to live in due to a mine subsidence occurrence.

On July 1, 2009, the Mine Subsidence Insurance Governing Board voted to increase the maximum limit of liability for mine subsidence insurance coverage to \$300,000, which is the maximum allowable under the current Ohio Revised Code.

Effective December 19, 2016, the Superintendent of Insurance seat on the Ohio Mine Subsidence Insurance Governing Board

was eliminated; therefore, reducing the Board to three members.

Program Funding

The Controlling Board approved an appropriation of \$200,000 as an initial reserve for the Fund on January 17, 1986. This initial reserve was to be used to pay subsidence claims resulting from active coal mining, from salt or industrial mineral extraction, and from post-August 3, 1977 abandoned coal mines. Repayment of these funds was completed in 1997.

What is Mine Subsidence Insurance?

Mine subsidence insurance provides coverage for loss caused by the collapse or lateral or vertical movement of structures resulting from the caving in of underground mines, including underground coal mines, clay mines, limestone mines and salt mines. It does not include loss caused by earthquake, landslide, volcanic eruption, or collapse of strip mines, any surface mines, or storm and sewer drains, or rapid transit tunnels.

For structures to be eligible for mine subsidence insurance, the following eligibility requirements must be met:

1. The primary structure must be an occupied 1-4 family dwelling and at least 50% of the total living area must be occupied. Seasonal properties are considered eligible for coverage as are properties under construction (if the property will become a 1-4 family occupied dwelling structure when completed).

2. The dwelling structure may have incidental occupancy if the occupancy does not cause the structure to be rated under commercial rating plans and if the structure qualifies for a homeowners, a farm owners, a dwelling fire, or other personal lines policy.

3. The dwelling structure must be located in one of the designated "mandatory" or "optional" counties.

4. The dwelling and detached private garages must be covered by a valid homeowners, farm owners, dwelling fire, or other personal lines insurance contract.

Additionally, coverage will be denied if a material misrepresentation of facts or circumstances concerning mine subsidence is made and/or if there is any increase in hazard within the control or knowledge of the insured.

What counties are insurable under the program?

Thirty-seven (37) Ohio counties are eligible for mine subsidence coverage under the mine subsidence program. Twenty-six (26) of these counties are mandatorily provided the coverage with their homeowners, farm owners, dwelling fire, or other personal lines insurance policies by attachment of the Mine Subsidence Insurance Coverage form. These 26 counties are: Athens, Belmont, Carroll, Columbiana, Coshocton, Gallia, Guernsey, Harrison, Hocking, Holmes, Jackson, Jefferson, Lawrence, Mahoning, Meigs, Monroe, Morgan, Muskingum, Noble, Perry, Scioto, Stark, Trumbull, Tuscarawas, Vinton, and Washington counties.

The optional counties are Delaware, Erie, Geauga, Lake, Licking, Medina, Ottawa, Portage, Preble, Summit, and Wayne counties. Insurance companies must offer coverage in these counties and property owners may purchase the mine subsidence coverage if they choose.

Whether in a "mandatory" or an "optional" county, the mine subsidence insurance coverage cannot be purchased separately. The insurance company providing the coverage will process the coverage attachment, collect the premium, and process any claims notices for OMSIUA. All responsibility for claims rests with OMSIUA and not with any individual member company.

The dwelling coverage provided is equal to that of the dwelling only or \$300,000.00, whichever is less. Additional limited coverage for driveways, sidewalks, private garages, and additional living expense/fair rental value may be applicable as

provided in the Mine Subsidence Insurance Coverage form. The maximum limit of liability under the policy is \$300,000. A minimum deductible of \$250.00 and a maximum of \$500.00 will apply per occurrence. Coverage does not extend to industrial/commercial buildings, barns, land, trees, crops, plants, or contents/personal property.

OUTREACH PROGRAM

Since 1997, the Ohio FAIR Plan, with the approval of the Mine Subsidence Insurance Governing Board, has partnered with the Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR) Division of Mineral Resource Management's (MRM) AML Section to undertake an outreach program that addresses the hazards of constructing residential housing above abandoned underground mines in the counties where mine subsidence coverage is available.

In 2002, ODNR expanded the outreach initiative by creating the *AML Development Guide* that included information and illustrations of the hazards associated with abandoned mine lands and referenced the Ohio FAIR Plan as a resource for information on past subsidence complaints. The guide was used in a comprehensive outreach effort to reach out to local officials in all coal bearing counties concerning the hazards of abandoned mine lands. From 2002 through 2011, copies of the guide were mailed biennially to legislators, township trustees, county commissioners, county engineers, county auditors, local health districts, and regional planning commissions.

MRM also partnered with the ODNR Division of Soil & Water Resources as well as the Soil and Water Conservation Districts (SWCD) to assist with distribution of the AML Development Guides to the public at the county level, which were mailed biennially to the SWCDs in 37 counties. The guide is now available on the ODNR website or by request.

In 2004 the outreach effort was enhanced once again when the Ohio FAIR

Plan and ODNR collaborated to develop a web based abandoned mine locator to assist the public and local officials in identifying the location of abandoned underground mines before development begins. The mine locator is an interactive website that shows the location of abandoned underground mines in relationship to any address or point of interest. Also in 2004, a 17-minute video was developed. The video compliments the AML Development Guide and is a resource for information concerning abandoned mine lands. In 2011 the guide and video were updated.

Currently, *AML Development Guide*, video, and mine locator are available to everyone on line at:

<http://minerals.ohiodnr.gov/abandoned-mine-land-reclamation/mine-locators>

CLAIM HANDLING

Mine Subsidence is different from any other catastrophe that damages structures. A fire to a building is usually extinguished in minutes and repairs can be started shortly after settlement with the insurance company. A mine subsidence event causes ground movement and this process can last for several weeks, months, or years. Because of the ongoing movement, structures damaged by subsidence cannot be repaired until this movement ceases.

Reporting of a Claim

Property owners, who have mine subsidence coverage and suspect that their structure has been damaged by mine subsidence, are to notify their insurance agent or company as soon as possible. The agent or company will then send written notification to the OMSIUA informing them of the date of loss, the date that the mine subsidence coverage was effective for the property owner, and the location suffering the loss. OMSIUA will assign an adjuster to perform the initial investigation.

Investigation of Cause

The adjuster's initial inspection consists of an interview of the property owner and examination of damage. Typical suspected subsidence damage might be:

- Cracks in basement walls, floor, and foundation.
- Separation of porches, patios, and chimneys from the main structure.
- Doors and windows that are "jammed" shut.
- Cracks in the exterior walls.
- Tilting of the structure.

OMSIUA's adjusters work in close cooperation with the Ohio Department of Natural Resources to investigate a suspected mine subsidence claim. State mine maps, maintained by the Division of Geological Survey, are carefully reviewed to determine if the property in question is undermined. The Division of Mineral Resource Management - Abandoned Mine Lands Program - is consulted to secure any additional mining information. Unfortunately, in many cases, there are no mining company records that indicate prior mining activity.

If the structure is in an area of Ohio known for its coal resources and if subsidence is suspected as a possible cause of loss by the adjuster, OMSIUA will utilize the services of trained geologists and engineers to further aid the investigation. These experts are familiar with the "finger print" of subsidence damage and have extensive knowledge of Ohio's geology.

Stabilization of the Abandoned Mine

If the investigators believe there is an emergency situation with respect to the structure being damaged by ongoing mine subsidence, the Ohio Department of Natural Resources, Division of Mineral Resource Management (DMRM), is informed so that their office can take the appropriate action. The DMRM administers the Abandoned Mine Lands (AML) Program, which includes the stabilization of mine subsidence areas. The

AML Program also oversees the Emergency Program, which allows for the immediate response to a subsidence event that poses a direct threat to the safety of the public. The subsidence can be halted in some cases through the "grouting" of underground mine voids. Grouting is the injection of concrete into specific areas of the abandoned underground mine to halt the subsidence.

Temporary Repairs to the Structure

OMSIUA will make temporary repairs to damaged structures if warranted. In some cases, it is necessary for extensive shoring procedures to be performed so that the building will not collapse. Extensive shoring efforts to protect the structure from collapse can cost several thousands of dollars.

Surveying

In certain cases of suspected mine subsidence, OMSIUA monitors the ground movement by surveying the structure. This technique involves establishing a survey line with monitoring points on the structure and the surrounding neighborhood. Initial benchmark measurements are taken with additional measurements occurring at intervals ranging from two to six months.

This investigation technique serves two purposes. First, if there is consistent and significant downward movement of the

structure, it is probable that a subsidence event is ongoing. Secondly, when that downward movement has stopped for an acceptable period of time, permanent repairs can be made to the structure.

Claims Payments

OMSIUA makes partial payments of claims to enable the property owner to have adequate funds for temporary repairs.

All claims are settled on a replacement cost basis, if repairs caused by a Mine Subsidence event are made. Dwelling coverage is limited to the amount of insurance being provided on the dwelling structure, or \$300,000.00, whichever is less.

Ohio Mine Subsidence Insurance Claims

In 2016, 31 claims were reported while in 2015, 47 claims were reported. In 2016, 36 claims were closed with payments of \$486,841.21 in paid losses and adjustment expenses. Reserves totaled \$528,900 at the end of 2016. In 2015, 63 claims were closed with payments of \$626,642.43 in paid losses and adjustment expenses. Reserves totaled \$835,402 at 2015's year-end. Exhibit 2 details the 2016 claims activity by county.

FINANCIAL STATEMENTS AND STATISTICAL INFORMATION

**OHIO MINE SUBSIDENCE INSURANCE FUND STATEMENT OF RECEIPTS,
DISBURSEMENTS, AND FUND BALANCE ACTUAL FOR 2015 AND 2016**

<i>Fund Balance (12/31/14)</i>	<i>\$12,203,104.80</i>
2015 Income (Premiums et al)	854,626.37
2015 Disbursements	<u>1,017,065.35</u>
<i>Fund Balance (12/31/15)</i>	<i>\$12,040,665.82</i>
2016 Income (Premiums et al)	886,459.38
2016 Disbursements	<u>848,909.92</u>
<i>Fund Balance (12/31/16)</i>	<i>\$12,078,215.28</i>

EXHIBIT 1

NUMBER OF ABANDONED AND ACTIVE MINES

COUNTY	ABANDONED MINES*	ACTIVE MINES-2016**
ALLEN	1	0
ATHENS	363	1
BELMONT	539	2
BUTLER	1	0
CARROLL	269	2
CLERMONT	0	1
COLUMBIANA	451	0
COSHOCTON	266	0
CUYAHOGA	1	1
DELAWARE	1	0
ERIE	1	0
FRANKLIN	0	1
GALLIA	171	0
GEAUGA	7	0
GUERNSEY	170	0
HAMILTON	1	0
HARRISON	145	3
HOCKING	307	0
HOLMES	102	0
JACKSON	458	0
JEFFERSON	503	3
LAKE	1	1
LAWRENCE	404	0
LICKING	3	0
LUCAS	1	0
MAHONING	184	2
MEDINA	36	0
MEIGS	257	1
MONROE	70	0
MORGAN	114	0
MUSKINGUM	441	1
NOBLE	207	0
OTTAWA	6	0
PERRY	485	2
PIKE	0	0
PORTAGE	16	0
PREBLE	1	0
SCIOTO	83	0
STARK	403	0
SUMMIT	36	0
TRUMBULL	21	0
TUSCARAWAS	573	1
VINTON	281	0
WASHINGTON	84	0
WAYNE	96	0
TOTAL	7,560	22

Source of mine information: Ohio Department of Natural Resources Division of Geological Survey.

*This data was totaled from known and unknown mine extents available in the GeoSurvey Abandoned Underground Mines SDE layer, which are also available in the ODNR Abandoned Underground Mines interactive map application. The data for those sources comes from multiple locations including paper and mylar map scans. This data should not be assumed to be a comprehensive list of all mines in Ohio, as some remain unknown or undocumented, but it is the completest data set of known mines available to date.**Active underground mines also include industrial mineral mines.

EXHIBIT 2

OMSIUA CLAIM ACTIVITY-2016

COUNTY	REPORTED CLAIMS	CLOSED CLAIMS	OPEN CLAIMS	RESERVES	CLAIM PAYMENTS	LOSS ADJ. EXP.
ATHENS	0	0	0	0	0	\$748.20
BELMONT	11	13	3	\$10,000	0	\$66,920.36
CARROLL	0	0	0	0	0	\$226.20
COLUMBIANA	2	2	0	0	0	\$3,181.50
COSHOCTON	0	0	0	0	0	0
DELAWARE	0	0	0	0	0	0
ERIE	0	0	0	0	0	0
GALLIA	1	1	0	0	0	\$4,265.86
GEAUGA	0	0	0	0	0	0
GUERNSEY	0	0	1	\$100,000	0	\$715.50
HARRISON	2	2	0	0	0	\$14,097.41
HOCKING	0	0	0	0	0	0
HOLMES	0	0	0	0	0	0
JACKSON	1	0	1	\$10,000	0	\$5,628.16
JEFFERSON	4	4	1	0	0	\$11,188.82
LAKE	0	0	0	0	0	0
LAWRENCE	0	0	0	0	0	\$553.50
LICKING	0	0	0	0	0	0
MAHONING	2	2	0	0	0	\$9,797.98
MEDINA	0	0	0	0	0	0
MEIGS	0	0	0	0	0	\$423.00
MONROE	0	1	0	0	0	\$1,287.60
MORGAN	0	0	0	0	0	0
MUSKINGUM	0	0	0	0	0	\$1,721.02
NOBLE	0	0	0	0	0	0
OTTAWA	0	0	0	0	0	\$1,530.25
PERRY	2	2	0	0	0	\$2,046.60
PORTAGE	0	0	0	0	0	0
PREBLE	0	0	0	0	0	0
SCIOTO	0	0	0	0	0	\$75.00
STARK	1	5	6	\$348,900	\$290,916.38	\$53,385.22
SUMMIT	0	1	0	0	0	\$7,481.70
TRUMBULL	5	3	3	\$60,000	0	\$3,655.30
TUSCARAWAS	0	0	0	0	0	\$4,916.45
VINTON	0	0	0	0	0	0
WASHINGTON	0	0	0	0	0	0
WAYNE	0	0	0	0	0	\$2,079.20
TOTALS	31	36	15	\$528,900	\$290,916.38	\$195,924.83

EXHIBIT 3

OMSIUA POLICIES AND PREMIUM WRITTEN-2016

COUNTY	POLICIES 2015	POLICIES 2016	PREMIUM 2015	PREMIUM 2016
ATHENS	16,153	16,187	\$16,153.63	\$16,187.29
BELMONT	23,252	22,991	\$23,252.12	\$22,990.95
CARROLL	10,671	10,644	\$10,671.39	\$10,644.07
COLUMBIANA	38,981	34,662	\$38,980.97	\$34,661.52
COSHOCTON	12,113	12,127	\$12,113.09	\$12,126.82
DELAWARE	7,539	7,945	\$26,386.97	\$27,808.16
ERIE	1,650	1,660	\$5,774.05	\$5,811.32
GALLIA	9,368	9,277	\$9,368.33	\$9,277.02
GEAUGA	3,217	3,220	\$11,258.51	\$11,269.67
GUERNSEY	14,153	14,272	\$14,153.14	\$14,271.76
HARRISON	5,859	5,881	\$5,858.82	\$5,881.46
HOCKING	10,073	10,145	\$10,073.20	\$10,144.82
HOLMES	7,927	7,898	\$7,926.89	\$7,898.01
JACKSON	9,777	10,192	\$9,776.17	\$10,191.89
JEFFERSON	22,575	22,273	\$22,575.43	\$22,273.00
LAKE	6,778	7,061	\$23,724.85	\$24,712.40
LAWRENCE	18,670	18,857	\$18,669.33	\$18,857.01
LICKING	4,458	4,647	\$15,605.70	\$16,266.76
MAHONING	74,924	74,256	\$74,924.06	\$74,255.98
MEDINA	7,664	7,886	\$26,824.46	\$27,600.72
MEIGS	7,322	7,297	\$7,321.96	\$7,297.41
MONROE	5,807	5,882	\$5,807.37	\$5,881.78
MORGAN	5,434	5,342	\$5,433.51	\$5,342.50
MUSKINGUM	27,712	27,728	\$27,711.82	\$27,728.07
NOBLE	4,531	4,557	\$4,530.46	\$4,556.83
OTTAWA	3,030	3,043	\$10,604.51	\$10,649.73
PERRY	11,132	11,253	\$11,132.23	\$11,252.76
PORTAGE	5,379	5,627	\$18,829.23	\$19,693.28
PREBLE	938	931	\$3,282.16	\$3,258.32
SCIOTO	22,272	22,187	\$22,271.40	\$22,187.23
STARK	123,803	124,223	\$123,802.71	\$124,222.32
SUMMIT	20,447	21,226	\$71,565.96	\$74,292.31
TRUMBULL	67,489	67,492	\$67,488.82	\$67,491.68
TUSCARAWAS	31,708	31,853	\$31,707.92	\$31,852.84
VINTON	3,818	3,821	\$3,817.89	\$3,820.60
WASHINGTON	21,622	21,894	\$21,621.80	\$21,894.42
WAYNE	5,386	5,464	\$18,853.14	\$19,125.22
TOTALS	673,632	671,901	\$839,854.00	\$843,677.93